## Keith Kerbel

**Deposition Transcript** 

No. 137, Original

IN THE

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

STATE OF MONTANA, Plaintiff

V.

STATE OF WYOMING

AND

STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA, Defendants

BEFORE THE HONORABLE BARTON H. THOMPSON, JR. SPECIAL MASTER

DEPOSITION OF

KEITH KERBEL

Taken at DNRC Regional Office 1371 Rimtop Drive Billings, Montana 59105

> Monday, April 23, 2012 9:03 a.m. - 5:23 p.m.

GRAF COURT REPORTING 2704 Highland Park Place Billings, Montana 59102 (406) 254-2576

Page 2	Page 4
APPEARANCES:  MONTGOMERY & ANDREWS LAW FIRM BY: JEFFREY J. WECHSLER, ESQUIRE  AND JOHN B. DRAPER, ESQUIRE (by telephone)  325 Paseo de Peralta Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501  Counsel for Plaintiff  MONTANA ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE BY: JENNIFER ANDERS, ESQUIRE P.O. Box 201401 Helena, Montana 59620  Counsel for Plaintiff  STATE OF WYOMING, OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL BY: PETER K. MICHAEL, ESQUIRE AND ANDREW KUHLMANN, ESQUIRE (by telephone) AND DAVID WILMS, ESQUIRE (by telephone)  123 State Capitol Building Cheyenne, Wyoming 82002  Counsel for Defendant State of Wyoming  ALSO PRESENT: Bern Hinckley  Reported by John B. Graf  22  23	It is hereby stipulated and agreed by and among counsel for the respective parties that the deposition be taken by John B. Graf, Freelance Court Reporter and Notary Public for the State of Montana, residing in Billings, Montana.  It was also stipulated by and among counsel for the respective parties that the deposition be taken in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.  It was further stipulated by and among counsel for the respective parties, and the deponent, that the reading and signing of the deposition transcript would be reserved.
23 24 25 Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576	Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576
Page 3	Page 5
1 INDEX 2 WITNESS: PAGE: 3 KEITH KERBEL 4 BY MR. MICHAEL 5, 277 5 BY MR. WECHSLER 267 6 Certificate of Witness 290 8 Certificate of Court Reporter 291 9 EXHIBITS 10 NO.: DESCRIPTION: 11 I Water Right Dispute Options 12 2 Final Order 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Thereupon,  KEITH KERBEL,  having been duly sworn to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, testified upon his oath as follows:  EXAMINATION  EXAMINATION  BY MR. MICHAEL:  Q. State your name, please.  A. Keith David Kerbel, K-e-r-b-e-l.  Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken before?  A. Yes.  Q. How many times?  A. Oh, probably just a guess, probably five.  Q. When was the last time?  A. It was for my current job at the Bureau of Reclamation. And it was in December of last year.  Q. Have you ever been deposed on issues involving the Yellowstone River Compact?  A. No.  Q. Have you ever testified in court?  A. No.
25 Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576	Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 10 Page 12 1 A. Yes. 1 decree, they would need to make a filing to claim 2 Q. When did you join -- well, did you have 2 those rights? 3 3 some natural resource-related work before you worked A. Correct. 4 for the State of Montana, between college and working 4 Q. And was that something that -- did you deal 5 5 for the State of Montana? with those rights in that position as water 6 A. Just worked on farms and ranches in the 6 appropriation specialist? 7 summers. 7 A. Correct. 8 O. And when did you begin working for the 8 Q. Did you also deal with the claims for mid 9 State of Montana? 9 (ph) rights as well? 10 A. June 28th, 1976. 10 A. Correct. O. And what was that first position? 11 11 Q. What was the -- what did you do -- what A. I was a water rights analyst or a 12 12 kinds of different tasks did you do when those 13 technician. 13 applications -- what were they called? Applications 14 Q. Out of what -- go ahead. 14 or claims? 15 A. I started in Billings. Worked there and 15 A. They were applications for provisional trained there for about three weeks. And then I 16 16 permits. And they were basically under the 1973 17 moved and lived in Broadus for a little over a year. 17 statute. Anybody who put water -- new uses of water 18 And we worked on the Powder River adjudication from 18 to beneficial use or changes or adding ground of any 19 '76 through '79. 19 kind needed to apply for and receive a permit before 20 20 O. So even after you left Broadus you still they started irrigating. And it was my job to 21 worked on the Powder River adjudication for a few 21 process those applications. And once they were 22 22 processed, they were issued. If no one -- if they didn't get objections 23 A. Out of Miles City. I was in Broadus for a 23 while, and then they transferred me to Miles City. 24 2.4 -- and if they got objections, we went through a And I worked on the northern end of the Powder River 25 hearings process. And there would have been an Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 11 Page 13 1 Basin for several years. 1 administrative hearing to determine whether the 2 O. And to your recollection, when was that --2 application should be denied, issued, or modified. 3 was there a temporary preliminary decree on the 3 Q. At that time was the water court involved 4 Powder or just a preliminary decree, do you recall? 4 in the process? 5 A. It was a preliminary -- temporary final, is 5 A. No. Not on the permitting process, no. 6 what they called it. 6 Q. You mentioned changes. And let me ask a 7 Q. Do you remember when that was? 7 sort of hypothetical, I guess. But what if you had a 8 A. This is only my recollection, but I think 8 situation -- we can pick a river, Tongue, Powder -- I 9 it was like 1980. 9 guess it doesn't matter -- where there was a --10 O. And then do you recall when the final was 10 somebody had been using water prior to 1973, said issued on the Powder River? 11 11 they had worked for Montana, I take it you would call 12 A. No, I don't remember. 12 a use right, and yet it hadn't been of record. That O. So was it three years as a water rights 13 13 right was not either filed in the county clerk's 14 technician or longer? 14 office or had not yet been adjudicated -- let's use A. I'm trying to think. I think it was 1978 15 15 the Powder, in adjudicating the Powder River 16 or '79 -- I don't remember exactly what year -- I was 16 adjudication, and that person wanted to change, for 17 promoted to a new appropriations specialist in Miles 17 example, the place of use from one field to another. 18 City. And what I did was, is I handled permits and 18 A. Uh-huh. 19 changes for the Department of Natural Resources in 19 Q. In that process of -- would they have to

20

21

22

23

24

25

apply to make that change?

their existing use right was?

Q. And what would be the basis of their

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

existing right? In other words, when you analyze the

change they wanted to make, how would you know what

A. Yes.

20

21

22

23

24

25

Southeastern Montana.

come into effect, so --

A. Correct.

Q. And I take it by that time the 1973 law had

adjudicated rights, for example, on the Tongue River

Q. -- water rights -- even folks with

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

7

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

Page 20

specialist sometime in '78 or '79. And then how long 1 2 were you in that position?

A. Until '81. Then I took the job in Billings as the field manager here in Billings. And that was January of '81, if my memory is correct.

Q. Field manager in --

A. For the Billings area office.

O. Of the DNRC?

A. DNRC, yeah.

Q. I believe --

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

24

25

11 A. We called them field offices, we called 12 them regional offices, we called them area offices. 13

I mean, the names changed over the course of time, but I was in that position until I retired in 2010.

Q. We took Rich Moy's deposition last week, and he stated -- and I'm not -- I'm just paraphrasing; I can't quote him. We don't have the transcript. But he stated that in the early '80s -he had started in '81 -- and he said that Montana made an effort to add resources out into the regions

away from Helena for water rights purposes and water management purposes. Is that correct?

A. Actually, it happened in '79, with the advent of Senate Bill 76 and new claims -- the new claims, the new adjudication program that was Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

A. Oh, golly. It fluctuated in size from probably three to -- we had upwards of eight people.

Q. Besides the task of assisting or processing claims, was there -- what other tasks was your group under your supervision supposed to do?

A. In the original capacity and from '82 on, our job basically was, you know, purely adjudication and permitting and processing changes. That was it. We -- part of our office worked on claims.

The first basin we started on was the Upper Yellowstone, and there was like close to 5,000 claims in the Upper Yellowstone. We examined those claims through a specific process to determine historical use. And then part of my staff, and myself included, worked on applications for new permits and changes.

After the deadline we had -- cripes. I'm trying to remember. Over 120 some applications for new permits and changes. And we also had stacks and stacks of claims in our office that we needed to review and coordinate and basically get processed. And that took a good year or plus in order to go through all of that paperwork that we received from the public.

Q. When was the first deadline? '82 or . . . A. Yeah. Oh, first deadline was January of Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 19

Page 21

initiated under Senate Bill 76, the Department hired field people, and we put them in area -- we put them in offices throughout the state of Montana to help citizens of Montana or water users in Montana fill out their water right claims.

And we had offices in Missoula and Dillon and Lewistown and Billings and Miles City, all over the state. Glasgow, Havre, Kalispell. Assisting the public, filling out water right claims. And that's what I did for several years when I worked for DNRC. Even in my position in Miles City and even in my position here in Billings was, I assisted people with filling out water right claims until -- the claim period was over April 30th, 1982.

Q. As field manager in Billings, besides having the responsibilities involving assisting claims, were you involved in the adjudication of the Powder River, for example?

A. At that point in time, no. Because that was still handled out of our Miles City office.

21 O. And who were your -- did you have 22 subordinates while you were field manager in Billings 23 from -- after '81?

A. Yeah.

O. How many?

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

'82. And the second deadline, it was extended to April 30th of '82.

Q. So how long were you the field manager? From '81 until when?

A. Until I retired.

O. Let's talk specifically, then. Let's focus in a little bit on the field manager -- well, what drainages were within the purview of your office as field manager? Tongue, Powder, Little Powder, those

11 A. They were out of Miles City. And we 12 handled the Upper Yellowstone and basically Pryor 13 Creek and the big one.

14 Q. So who in -- did you have supervisory 15 authority over the folks in Miles City, however?

A. No.

O. Who did?

A. Walter Rolf, R-o-l-f.

O. What was his title?

A. Same as mine.

O. He was field manager?

A. He was the field manager. Another title we 22 23 had was area office supervisor. We had all kinds of

24 titles. I don't remember the right order, when we

25 had them.

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 22 Page 24 do that. 1 O. How long was Walter Rolf the field manager 1 2 in Miles City? 2 A. Okay. 3 A. I don't remember. If -- if I was to 3 Q. When you were field manager did you have a 4 recollect, it was like early '90s. And then he 4 direct supervisor in the chain of command? A. Oh, yes. 5 5 retired. 6 Q. Was it always the same position, or did Q. Did he have a successor? 6 7 7 A. Yeah. You're looking at him. I took over that person change? Were there reorganizations? 8 8 the Miles City office. 9 Q. When you started in 1981, then, who -- what 9 Q. You stayed here in Billings, but they moved 10 10 was the name of the position that supervised your the responsibilities, combined the responsibilities? 11 A. Yeah. 11 O. So sometime in the early '90s you became 12 12 A. He was the water rights bureau chief. And basically the field manager that did cover the 13 that was Laurence Siroky. And he was my immediate 13 Tongue, Powder, and Little Powder, correct? 14 14 supervisor. Q. Was he in Helena? 15 15 A. Yes. 16 16 A. Yes. Q. I was going to say, I saw your name in a lot of meetings while you were dealing with the Upper 17 17 Q. And then I take it, at some point did Gary 18 18 Fritz become water rights bureau chief? Yellowstone. 19 A. Well, what would happen is this, is Gary 19 A. No. Fritz and -- or Rich or whoever was coming down for 20 Q. Was he ever water rights bureau chief? 20 those meetings, they'd swing by Billings, and they'd 21 A. No. 21 22 Q. Jack Stults was then, at some point, wasn't 22 grab me and take me down to -- I went to Cody, 23 23 Thermopolis, Sheridan, to a lot of the meetings that he? 24 they had with the compact. 24 A. Oh, boy that's a good question. No, I And all I did at that particular time, 25 don't think Jack was ever water rights bureau chief. 25 Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 23 Page 25 1 basically, was they just -- I never -- I didn't 1 I don't remember. I can't remember for sure. 2 participate too much. I usually sat in the back and 2 Q. Well, let's just go through, and you can 3 tell me who they were. 3 visited with my counterparts on the Wyoming side. 4 Q. Was the Clark's Fork of the Yellowstone 4 A. Okay, I'll try. 5 ever within your --5 Q. You mentioned Larry? 6 A. Yes. 6 A. Larry Holman. And then there was -- well, 7 Q. Out of Billings? 7 there was Laurence Siroky. And he was the one that 8 hired me. And then Ralph Saunders, and he hired me 8 A. Yes. 9 originally, back in '76. And then in '81 I was 9 Q. So you had lengthy experience really in all 10 10 four of the streams? promoted to the field office supervisor here in A. Correct. 11 Billings, and Laurence hired me for that position, if 11 12 12 O. Tributaries to the Yellowstone that are the I remember right. And then Larry Holman got the job 13 later in the mid '80s. 13 subject of this lawsuit, correct? 14 A. Yes. May I add something? 14 Then we did a reorganization. And then I 15 Q. Sure. 15 went -- and Larry retired. And then they basically A. This lawsuit only involves Tongue and 16 16 put all of the area office supervisors under the 17 17 direct supervision of the water resource Q. That's true. I should say it involved in 18 administrator. And don't ask me when that happened, 18 19 because I can't remember the year. 19 the compact --20 But basically we became -- instead of 20 A. Right. 21 Q. -- between Wyoming and Montana. 21 working for the bureau chief in water rights, we 22 2.2 started working for the administrator for water 23 Q. You're right. I stand corrected. 23 resources division, which expanded our roles in our Let's talk a little bit about the chain of 24 jobs. It was like getting a brand spanking new job. 24 25 Q. And who were the water resource 25 command. I think this will help us on later on if we Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

Page 28

Page 29

- administrators that you would supervise --1
- 2 A. Gary Fritz was first, and then he retired.
- 3 And then it was Jack Stults.
  - O. And then Tubbs?
  - A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

19

20

21

22

23 24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

25

- Q. John Tubbs, T-u-b-b-s.
- A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Just referring to the reorganization -- I 9 realize you didn't recall exactly when that occurred, 10 but what was your role before the reorganization, and 11 how did it expand?
- 12 A. My role before the reorganization was 13 predominantly water rights. We worked on the 14 adjudication program. We had two functions in the office, primarily. One was processing applications 15 for changes and permits; and the second function was 16 17 adjudication, examining claims for the Montana water 18 courts.

After the re-org, my role was expanded, and we still did that, but then they gave us other duties. One was state projects. So I was -- worked with our state projects bureau in Helena on both --Tongue River Reservoir and Cooney Reservoir and Glacier Lake are the three projects in our area. I

was also -- worked on dam safety. Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

the EIS, I helped John Sanders with the EIS and worked with reviewing EIS and operating plans for the 3 dam.

Q. The Cheyenne compact -- I think it was '92, if I recall -- but in the early '90s. Montana obviously was negotiating that with the Cheyenne Tribe and the United States. Were you involved in that process?

A. No. My counterpart in Miles City was involved with the Cheyenne compact, more so than I was. I sat in on some of the meetings when they were here in Billings, just as an observer.

13 Q. Who was your counterpart that was involved 14

A. Walter Rolf.

O. Is he around?

A. He's in Miles City.

Q. Retired?

A. Yes. They closed the office in Miles City, and then I took over that area, because of the lack of work.

O. When was that office closed?

A. I think it was '94, but don't hold me to that. And that's only -- like I said, I'm trying to be as accurate as I can, but that's what my memory

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 27

And we had to hire an engineer at that time, and he basically worked on the dam safety program for Southeastern Montana. And then his area was from Livingston to Glendive, Sidney area, for dam safety.

And then floodplain, we had to work with the floodplain program in Eastern Montana, and our engineer and I basically worked -- our area basically was from Park County, Livingston, Gardner area, all the way down to Miles City, Glendive, and Sidney. For that area, even though we had a Miles City office, we still worked that area with those two

And then -- let me see. I know I'm missing some. But our list was greatly expanded in our duties all the way through this whole process, then.

- Q. Did you have involvement in the expansion and rebuild of the Tongue -- or refurbishing, I guess, of Tongue River Reservoir? Was that within your purview?
- 21 A. My engineer spent four years down there on that project. So I was involved through his 22 23 involvement.
- Q. How about the --24

programs in particular.

A. And I -- excuse me. And then when they did Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

seems to tell me. That was early '90s.

2 Q. Your estimates are fine for most of these. 3 We have documents if we need to get more specific. 4

A. Okay.

Q. If you have an estimate, it helps us. I think these can mostly be confirmed on our documents if necessary?

A. Okay. Now, what participation he had in the compact? I don't know. I just know that it was in his area, and he was involved to some extent.

Q. In the area of administration of water rights, which I understand that Montana -- we have documents we'll look at later, I'm sure. But Montana water courts will at times -- based on requests via court filings, will appoint commissioners to regulate a stream during the water year, for example?

A. Yeah, district court does that. Not Montana water court.

Q. Montana water court is an adjudication court?

21 A. Sure, yes.

22 Q. So the district court will appoint those. 23 Do you have any involvement within your position

24 here, that longtime position, with that process?

25

A. Yes.

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 46 Page 48 1 Q. If we wanted to go back from, say, 2008 -measuring device? 2 was it 2008 that you left the --2 A. They know how much they're diverting, so I 3 A. 210. 3 assume they do, yes. 4 Q. 2010, rather. 4 Q. Is there a weir, do you know? 5 -- and tried to reconstruct which post-'50 5 A. I don't know, to be honest with you. 6 water rights took what water and when, is there any 6 Q. And I can ask Roger --7 database that we could use other than trying to find 7 A. Muggli. 8 the ranchers' own records or their recollections? 8 Q. -- Muggli? A. You would have to -- there would be 9 A. Right. 9 10 individual ranchers. 10 But they do measure the flows out of the 11 Q. Let's kind of follow that thread a little 11 river. And they kept track of those wells. 12 bit on the Tongue River, because there was a decree 12 O. Can you describe for me the systems going 13 on the Tongue River after 1914, correct? 13 up to the Tongue River Reservoir in Montana, or is it 14 A. Correct. 14 a combination of pumps and also head gates? 15 15 A. That pretty much describes how they use Q. And we know there were some years that 16 there were commissioners appointed to administer the 16 water on the Tongue. It's pumps and head gates for 17 Tongue River diversions, right? 17 the most part. A lot of it is sprinkler. People 18 A. Uh-huh. 18 have gone more to sprinkler than they have in the Q. And that was in the 2000s? 19 19 past. 20 20 A. Yes. They had -- and that was part of the NRCS. 21 Q. How many years -- can you give me an 21 They had a program, basically, that they felt 22 estimate of how many years it was administered? 22 sprinklers saved water. We found out differently. 23 But anyway, to make a long story short, they gave a 23 A. No, I can't. 24 Q. I take it the record source for -- well, 24 lot of cost share money, the individuals, to install 25 let me ask you this about the Tongue: Is it similar 25 sprinklers. So a lot of people took that cost share Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 47 Page 49 1 to the Powder, or is there also other types of 1 and put sprinklers in. 2 diversions besides pumping that's significant on the 2 And another reason is -- same thing in 3 3 Wyoming is -- is that it's hard to get people to help Tongue? 4 A. They have gravity ditch. T sprinklers. 4 in flood irrigation anymore and carry a shovel and go 5 Q. Is T&Y -- that starts as a ditch? 5 out there and walk around and tramp in the mud. So 6 A. Yes. That's a gravity ditch with a 6 sprinklers accomplish another thing, too; they allow 7 7 diversion dam across. an opportunity to irrigate without having to hire a 8 8 O. So the individual users within the -- is bunch of irrigators to carry a shovel around out 9 9 there and push water. that an irrigation district? 10 Q. On the Powder River it sounds like it's 10 A. Yes. 11 Q. Are the individual water users within that 11 more of a flood irrigation system because, you're district -- how do they remove the water from the 12 talking -- you're telling about me about spreaders 12 13 13 being commonly used in Montana, correct? canals? 14 14 A. Checks and head gates. A. Yes. Q. That's a major nonpumping type of diversion Q. Has there been some sprinkler system in the 15 15 in the Tongue, correct? 16 Powder River? 16 17 17 A. Correct. A. I understand there's one or two. There's Q. I say "major," but it's a fairly large 18 18 not very many, a very small amount. But I understand 19 diversion, right? 19 they've tried to use a few. 20 A. Yeah. It's -- they burn 200 cfs about. 20 O. How about the Little Powder? 21 And they irrigate about 9,700 acres. 21 A. That is purely water spraying. They pump Q. Let me ask you the same questions about --22 and divert through ditches and pump depending upon 22 let's just talk about T&Y. Is there a measuring how much lift they have. But the Powder River, 23 23 24 device at the T&Y's, a conversion point from the 24 they'll irrigate -- like the Little Powder, they'll river? They have a dam, you say, but is there a 25 irrigate in February. They'll go out and chop a hole 25 Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

19

21

2.2

23

Page 64

Page 65

1 used most of the water.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

17

18

19

20

After the 4th of July, normally speaking, the only water available was dam water. Dam water generally ran out by Labor Weekend, as a normal time frame. Some years it was earlier, some years it was later. But as a rule of thumb, they ran out of storage by Labor Weekend. And they were pretty much

So they had committee meetings, operating committee meetings, basically on the river several times during the year to determine releases, when to start storing, when to start releasing, and who's making call for water. And then they would coordinate those decisions with the water commissioners.

The first year the water commissioners were on, they started shutting people off. They had to go down and basically determine what the flow rate was for all the users down the stream, between the dam and T&Y.

So the first summer both guys went down and measured all the diversions to double-check their flow rates. And then they enforced it as they went on. So they were the ones making the call, but they had to coordinate the releases with the dam tender

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

7 water user whose direct flow right was post-'50 or 2 pre-'50, correct?

A. Correct. Generally speaking, if there was any natural flow in the river after the 4th of July, it belonged to T&Y and Brown Cattle, on most years.

So after the 4th of July -- and I'm just talking about normal years and below normal years -those two water rights had to be filled first. Generally speaking, that was about all that was in the river, when you start looking at losses.

After 4th of July, normally, anybody who wanted to irrigate a second cutting of hay -- and here's a big number. Everybody pretty much irrigated in April and May on the Tongue. I mean, the water was pretty good. A lot of times there were high flows; we could fill a reservoir except for those four years.

And then you go back in the '80s, and you ran into the same situations in the '80s. The '90s, not so bad. We were in better shape in the '90s. But the late '80s especially and the early 2000s to 2006 -- 2005 was an interrupter, as I called it. That's how it normally operated, you know, in those dry years. And they pretty much ran out of storage by Labor Weekend, like I said before.

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 63

and the president so they knew enough water was being

dumped into the river to mandate who's using what water, where, downstream and characterize the losses involved. So those two guys basically ran the river for those years. O. You mentioned that there were some rights

between the Wyoming state line and the intake of the Tongue River Reservoir. Would the commissioners go up and regulate?

10 A. They had authority to. I don't know if 11 they did.

- Q. I would have to ask them, I guess.
- 13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Do you know what kind of diversion points 15 there are between the dam and up to the Wyoming line? 16

- A. Pumps.
- Q. I take it when there's a release from -your understanding, I guess, from what you've said is -- well, you haven't said this, but let me ask you: If the waters being released from Tongue
- 21 River Reservoir -- say it's after the 4th of July and 22 most of the water in the river is going to be
- 23 released from storage.
- A. Uh-huh. 24 25
  - Q. Those releases could be contracted for by a Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

1 But that's why I say if you weren't those 2 two early users that were 1886, you were calling for 3 and buying -- you basically were using your purchased 4 water. Contract water was from the reservoir. That 5 was a normal operation. If I was to issue a permit 6 on Tongue River, I would only issue it for the spring 7 runoff. Because that's all that's available, in my 8

- Q. Which is -- and what you just talked a little bit ago -- in other words, if you put a date restriction --
- A. A date restriction would be right, June 30th.
  - Q. That would be the end date?
- A. That would be the end date.
- 16 Q. So do you know how the commissioners would 17 operate -- let's say -- Brown Cattle is near where 18 Hanging Woman is?
  - A. No. Yes, correct.
- 20 Q. Where Hanging Woman and --
  - A. Birney.
  - Q. Birney, Montana?
  - A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Say Brown Cattle had irrigated and they 25 were ready to cut hay -- I'm just going to give you a

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 98 Page 100 1 somehow. I don't know. I wasn't around. 1 down. 2 2 I should say the 450 is a number that I A. Yes. 3 Q. Forsyth would be the courthouse? 3 heard. I don't know if it's accurate, but a large 4 A. Yes. percentage of the objections were name changes. 5 Q. And the paper right was never put to 5 Q. Go ahead and open that -- go back to the beneficial use. Let' say 1927 somebody went to the 6 first page. And what it is, is -- and, again, this 6 7 7 is the declaration of Richard Moy? courthouse and filed a right to use water on the 8 A. Uh-huh. He's over 18? 8 Tongue River. q A. Correct. 9 Q. He is over 18. He said he was. He looked 10 Q. And then it was never put to beneficial use 10 to be last week, but well preserved. 11 at all before the adjudication, which is now still in 77 A. I would say he's probably all of 19. Just process today. Could that right have been 12 12 13 recommended for approval by DNRC, typically? 13 Q. Now, you're aware that -- well, let's just 14 A. If it was never put to beneficial use, then 14 go through a couple things. I want you to turn some 15 what DNRC would have done -- they would have looked 15 pages, real quick. Turn to the next page after his at the aerial photos. They would have looked at the 16 16 signature page, will you. 17 '44 photos, they would have looked at this late '70, 17 A. Yes. 18 early '80s photos, and they would have seen no 18 Q. And we have a letter dated May 18th, 2004, 19 irrigation. They would have put zero acres found in 19 and it's a letter from Jack Stults to Pat Tyrrell? 2.0 the '44 photo, zero acres found in the '80 photo or 20 A. Uh-huh. 21 21 '79 photo or '78 photo. If it didn't show -- if it Q. And I've been referring to this as the call letter, because it says it's a call letter. 22 didn't have any irrigation, like you said, they would 22 put that remark on that claim, if a claim was filed 23 23 A. Okay. 24 on that piece of paper. 24 Q. If you look on the second page of that 25 Now, someone else would have to object to 25 letter, the middle paragraph. And I don't know whose Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 99 Page 101 1 1 writing's on that, it may have been Rich Moy, may Q. What if someone else didn't object to it, 2 2 have written that when we talked to him last week. 3 and it got before the judge? Do you kind of have a 3 A. I don't see any writing. 4 4 feel for whether judges in the Tongue and Powder Q. These little notes, marks here. But 5 River were approving those? 5 anyway, we were talking about that paragraph with 6 A. Well, it fell on the water court. And 6 him, so it's good that it's highlighted. 7 7 knowing the master that I know on the Powder River, It says this letter comes to -- it's 8 8 in all likelihood, in my opinion, she's pretty Montana's call on the terms of the compact -- for a 9 hard-nosed. She'd toss it. 9 valid and protected pre-'50 water rights on the Tongue River and Powder Rivers. We're calling for 10 10 Q. And was that true leading up to the -- in 11 11 the '80s, leading up to the preliminary decree on the all pre-'50 junior waters in Wyoming to satisfy our 12 Powder, that those kinds of claims got tossed? 12 senior pre-'50 water on the Tongue and Powder Rivers. 13 A. We would no-right them, yes. 13 I just read that to you, okay? Q. But did the judge at that time tend to toss 14 A. Okay. 14 15 15 Q. I have a question with that. them? 16 16 A. I would -- yes. Unless that claimant First of all, do you know of any other 17 objected and came in and convinced the judge letters that reported to be call letters from Montana 17 otherwise over our recommendation. I don't know. I 18 DNRC to Wyoming prior to 2004? 18 19 19 wasn't around then, so I can't -- I don't know. A. Letters? 20 It was my understanding there were close to 20 O. Yeah. 21 10,000 water rights on the Powder River, and we got 21 A. No, I'm not aware of any. 500 objections, and 450 of them were name changes. 22 Q. Are you aware of any instance prior to May 22 23 18th of 2004 when a representative of Montana DNRC 23 And it's my understanding that the balance of the 24 ones that were objected to, were ran through the 24 said to a representative of the State of Wyoming we 25 system, were resolved through the water court 25 want you -- the State of Montana would like you to Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

Page 104

curtail water use on the Tongue River and the Powder River to allow more water to pass the state line into Montana?

A. Well, maybe not in those exact words, but pretty much every doggone annual meeting that I went to -- we basically -- in different words, basically, said -- and tried to work with Wyoming to make sure that we have water coming in from Wyoming into Montana to satisfy our water needs. I mean, those annual meetings, I mean, we basically -- almost every -- I shouldn't say almost every one, except for the wet years, but pretty much we made that point, that all the -- especially the ones that are drier years, that we needed water, and is there anything Wyoming can do to help us out?

I mean, that's basically, I think, how it was presented to Wyoming. And a lot of those meetings, is there anything -- and Gary asked Jeff that, and I know they asked Pat that, if there's anything Wyoming could do to get more water down to Montana and work up a system that we could do that.

- Q. And the annual meetings would generally be in November and December --
- A. Correct.

Q. -- of each year?
Graf Court Reporting
(406) 254-2576

letter?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And I refer to the May 18, 2004, letter as the call letter.
  - A. Yeah.
- Q. But, I guess, let me go back to my
  question, because I want to make sure we're clear.
  Because I do want to talk about the various things
  that were said at annual meetings and at various
  discussions and what Montana was trying to discuss
  with Wyoming.

  I want to go get back to that, but first I

I want to go get back to that, but first I really want to be clear on this: What I have in mind is a communication from Montana to Wyoming in the water year, and you mentioned a minute ago the discussions at the end of the meeting would be too late to do any good for that water year, correct?

- A. Yeah, but we always had hope for the next year, you know. That's how western water works. You always have hope and prayer for the next year.
- Q. But what I'm thinking of is a situation where, for example, like this letter we just talked about, May 18th, 2004, where Montana said we want you, this year, following -- after you receive this letter of May 18 -- and I'm paraphrasing, but we want Graf Court Reporting

  (406) 254-2576

Page 103

Page 105

A. They were always after the fact, and we were always looking forward to next year. But I mean, that was the reason for the compact meetings, was to negotiate give and take. To try to work out a system between the two states so we're not pissed off at each other all the time, and we can work out an agreement to foster a good relationship between the two states so we didn't have to send letters out like this and may call like this. Because that was one of the reasons that we had to -- we tried to put the tech team together.

But that worked for a while and then Pat Tyrrell, at one of the meetings -- and I don't remember exactly which one, but he basically told us that a higher authority is going to have to tell him, to tell a Wyoming water user to shut down to make Montana happy.

And he said that basically if he did that -- if he shut off -- in his position, as an appointed position, as a state engineer, the impression I got from Pat -- basically what he said that day of the meeting was that if he shut down a Wyoming user to make sure water was in our reservoir, he would lose his job. And I believe him.

Q. Was that something that was after this call Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 you to curtail pre-'50 water rights that are junior to our pre-'50 water rights so that more water passes the border this year, is the way I interpret this letter. Is that what this letter was intended to do?

- A. Uh-huh.
- O. Yes?
- A. Well, that's about -- I didn't write the letter or whatever, but that's what -- that was my impression of what they wanted, yeah, that we needed more water this year.
- Q. This year. And so I guess what I'm saying is we have this one, but I'm asking: Are there other letters or other communications where the request was we are short of water this year in Montana; we want you to curtail your water users so that we get more?
  - A. Well --
- Q. Was that call -- I call that a call. Do you call that a call?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Was that kind of a call ever made before 2004, to your knowledge, by Montana?
- A. Not in that specific words, but the inferences were there. We basically -- I know our water resource administrator a lot of times left a lot of those meetings frustrated because we walked Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 108

Page 109

away accomplishing nothing. 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

We didn't develop any kind of mechanism to -- if there was a difference of opinion between the two states, we always felt frustrated walking away that Wyoming always had the upper hand because they're upstream.

Now, whether someone sat there at the table and said Jeff or Pat, we need water; it's December; the year's gone by. We're meeting after the fact. It already happened. We talked about what happened this last summer. The frustration was already there in a lot of cases in dry years that we experienced.

And basically, when you walked out of the room, there was nothing accomplished other than trading information. But there was no mechanism in place to have Wyoming release water to Montana. And I think that was a frustration with a lot of folks on the compact on the Montana side.

I think it was inferred. I don't know if it was specifically said, but I know that it was inferred.

Q. But the one you -- you again lapsed back into telling me about what was inferred in annual meetings after the water year. And I'm looking for the communications that say this water year going

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

1 water to give to you. I know we talked about trying 2 to get water in '88 down to Montana. And I was told 3 that basically it was used up. I mean, Wyoming used 4 5

And I know in recent years Carmine, he always told me that -- he says Kerbel, you've got to understand something. You fail to understand that the Bighorns are a sponge. They're not a rock.

Q. If you hit the table, I'm not sure about the people on the phone --

A. But I'm just saying that's what I was told. And that was a frustrating part of my job, because you would go down and talk to people to try to work up a way to manage the water in the basin. And that's the response I met.

So how many times am I supposed to ask for water and when, when I don't get a response better than that, that this is a sponge and it's not a rock? You think this is a rock and everything runs off.

O. Well --

A. And I'm going okay, then that sends me a message that this is a futile -- everything's futile.

Q. Well, I'm not really interested in how you're supposed to, because I'm not in your shoes, okay? But I am interested in --

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 107

1

2

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23 2.4

25

A. Well, I wish you were. You would understand what it's like.

3 Q. But I'm interested in when it was done, if 4 it was done, because I can't --

A. I know -- I'm sure we did in '88. I can't say for a fact, but I know we did in '88. I shouldn't say I know, but I would guess if it happened at any time before 2000, it would have happened in '87, '88, or '89. But I'd have to defer to the minutes.

Q. You say --

A. Because we were short.

Q. And when you refer to the minutes, what minutes? Of what?

A. The compact meetings.

Q. The annual meetings?

A. Yeah.

But I know we -- I'm pretty certain we -- I wasn't -- the problem was in those years I wasn't an active participant back then. I went to some of the meetings. I don't even know if I went to that one in '88, because that year was -- for me was a hell on wheels. I mean, I almost quit I don't know how many times that summer.

> That was a wild summer. I mean, we were Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

forward we would like you to curtail.

A. You would have to look in the minutes.

Q. Well, I'm asking for your memory, though. We can look through the --

A. I can't answer that. I'm just saying it was --

Q. Well, let me say this. My question is: Do you recall that being said at a time in a water year where Montana is saying this year we would like you to curtail water use in Wyoming so more water flows down the Tongue, Powder, or Little Powder Rivers?

A. I don't recall it ever being said, but I know it was inferred.

Q. Well, who inferred it?

A. I think Rich did or Gary did.

Q. And do you recall what year that --

A. No, I don't. No, I don't.

Q. Do you know where? What city? What town?

A. No, I don't. I know they inferred -- I know in '88 we had a hell of a time. In '87, '88,

and '9, I know we were short on both sides of the

22 border. I know it was a frustrating summer.

> Talking to the Wyoming folks and Montana folks, when I talked to those guys, they kept saying well, it's the same thing down here. There's no

> > Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 110 Page 112 1 running seven ways from Sunday on complaints, because 1 measuring device of anybody on main stem Tongue. And 2 I was the enforcing agency, my office. 2 those are the things that we were trying to work 3 O. But if we look at the annual minutes and it 3 toward and -- is to try to work on main stem Tongue. shows you weren't there, I guess you couldn't say if And the frustrating part I have, too, is 4 5 it was said, could you? 5 over by Dayton -- I would go over to Dayton, and A. That's correct. 6 there's alfalfa higher than my hip. Now, I don't 7 Q. And so we rely on the minutes to have the 7 know what water rights they had. I don't know what 8 attendees -- Rich Moy said he made an effort to get 8 priority they had. But I didn't see that on our side 9 the minutes up to speed, beginning in the early '80s, 9 of the hill. You know, and that's kind of the 10 to have those minutes really reflect what went on. 10 frustrating part. 11 A. He did. 11 And then another situation was -- and I don't know the water right. I don't know anything 12 O. He made that effort? 12 13 A. Yes. 13 else. But I talked to Mike -- and it was in this 14 Q. And was it successful, as far as you know? 14 2000 period. And I asked Mike, I said, hey, there's 15 A. As far as I know. 15 a ditch -- and I was up to Dayton, and Mike wanted me 16 Q. You actually had opportunities in the 2000s 16 to go up and look at this gauging station up there in 17 to review the minutes, correct? 17 the canyon, which I did. And so I went up there and A. Yes, I did. 18 18 checked it. Q. And if --19 19 Every month I'm working at Tongue River A. I did, too. 20 20 Reservoir, Tongue River Dam. We're doing piezels 21 Q. And if you had concerns or comments, you 21 (ph) and making sure that there's no leakage in the dam. A lot of times I ran into Sheridan, grabbed a 22 would speak up, correct? 22 23 23 A. That's correct. bite of lunch, and sometimes I'd run up to Dayton and Q. And so would Rich Moy? 24 see how the creek is doing. And this is in the 24 25 A. Yes. 2.5 summer months. Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 111 Page 113 Q. Jack Stults? 1 1 Well, one time when I was up there -- and I A. Yes. 2 2 think it was 2004. I won't -- I'm not certain, but I 3 3 Q. So what was -- you talk about the think it was. And there was a pipe going up a 4 frustration. But in your discussion here with me you 4 hillside from a ditch, an irrigation ditch. It 5 talk about Montana wanting to get this compact to be 5 looked like it was coming from an irrigation ditch, 6 6 workable in a sense. I'm paraphrasing what you said, and it was an existing ditch. 7 7 but is that a fair characterization? And they've got a wheel line system and 8 8 A. Yeah. Well, basically, my characterization they've got sprinklers and they've got everything 9 9 was -- I don't know if it was the compact, but the going up there. And I mean, it's a heyday field. 10 10 compact was the overriding umbrella. But just work They're irrigating like crazy. And it looked like it out a system on dry years where we could both share 11 11 was coming under the irrigation ditch. 12 shortages. 12 So I called up Mike. Mike, being the good 13 Q. And what water rights would -- share 13 old boy that he is -- which he is. I have a lot of 14 shortage? I mean, was there a discussion -- did 14 good feelings about Mr. Whitaker. He at least tried. 15 15 Montana want pre-'50 rights in Wyoming to share He said he went out and did the field investigation 16 16 shortages with pre-'50 rights in Montana? and found out they're irrigating from springs. Well, 17 A. Well, like there's 200,000 acre-feet in 17 it wasn't coming out of the ditch. So it was coming 18 18 Lake DeSmet, and it's post-'50 water. The storage on out of springs right there by Dayton. 19 19 Lake DeSmet, it's post-'50. You know, there's a I took him at his word. 20 opportunity to -- in my mind, that we could work 20 Q. So did you follow up on that at all? Did 21 21 together on that. you ever get any further --

A. No. I never got any other feedback. And I asked Mike, I said, well, is there -- because they're

post-'50, whatever? I was asking him questions about

spring water, basically -- I don't know -- is that

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

22

23

24

25

22

23

24

25

And basically, there's -- as far as I know,

there was no enforcement. I was told this by Mr.

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

Whitaker that they've never shut off any water user

on main stem Tongue. In fact, they never required a

Page 118 Page 120 1 But you were at the meeting earlier that 7 A. Uh-huh. 2 year, I think, at a technical meeting earlier that 2 Q. And you said that happened quite a bit at 3 spring, correct? 3 annual meetings? 4 A. I believe so. 4 A. That's why we had technical team meetings. 5 Q. I was curious. Just maybe this is a side 5 We started using technical team meetings, you know, 6 item, but one of the ranchers had mentioned it had 6 to try to work out a water management plan between 7 gone down to ten degrees last week around Broadus. 7 the two states. 8 A. I wouldn't doubt it. 8 And Sue and I were supposed to get that 9 Q. This year we would doubt it, wouldn't we? 9 thing rolling -- and Sue and I and Chuck were 10 A. Yes. 10 supposed to get that thing rolling. And we had a 11 Q. What does that do to alfalfa? Does that 11 hard time coordinating getting Sue down here to help 12 12 damage -work with us on that. 13 A. It depends upon when it is. 13 Q. Were there times when Montana, in those 14 Q. How mature the crop is? 14 discussions, had asked Wyoming to work on Montana 15 A. (Indicating.) 15 seniors being able to call off Wyoming juniors? Is 16 Q. You have to say yes or no, verbally. 16 that something Montana wanted expressed to Wyoming? 17 A. It basically depended upon what stage the 17 A. Yeah, I think so. 18 crop is in when it gets cold. 18 Q. And what was the theory -- was there a O. So the letter -- we were just talking about 19 19 discussion about whether that was a compact -- within 20 20 a little bit the letter that came out the next day Montana's people -- and don't tell me what lawyers 21 after this memo we're talking about. Mr. Stults told 21 said. But within your water management people, was 22 Wyoming that Wyoming should regulate its pre-1950 22 there a discussion about what the compact did in that junior water rights in favor of Montana senior 23 23 regard, how it was laid out as far as pre-'50 Montana 2.4 pre-'50 water rights. Do you recall that being in 24 irrigators calling off pre-'50 Wyoming irrigators? 25 that letter? 25 A. We were just working basically from the Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 119 Page 121 A. I think so. 1 1 theory that seniors making call on juniors. That 2 Q. You can look at it if you want. It's on 2 basically was the theory that we were working off of, 3 the second page. 3 as far as just making a normal call on a river, on a 4 A. Yes. 4 stretch of river; is just trying to make, you know, 5 Q. Were you involved in discussions that led 5 seniors calling off the juniors. That's all we were 6 to that demand, with Mr. Stults or anybody else at 6 trying to do. 7 7 Q. Without regard to whether the rights being DNRC? 8 8 A. I was in Billings. A lot of those called off were pre-'50 or post-'50 in Wyoming? 9 discussions went on in Helena. 9 A. Pretty much. Just like a normal call would 10 10 O. Well, you did talk to Mr. Stults the day be on any creek, just without the state line being 11 before, however? 11 there. 12 A. On this, yes. And I got this information. 12 But Pat made it very clear that he couldn't As far as the decision made on this one here, they 13 13 shut anybody down in Wyoming without a higher 14 never asked me one way or another. I went out and 14 authority telling him to do so. And that basically 15 got this information. 15 prompted our action, in my opinion. Q. Well --16 16 Q. And he made that clear after this call 17 17 letter? A. I did volunteer -- wait a minute. I don't 18 think I did. No. I'll back off. I didn't do that. 18 A. Right. Q. After May 18th, 2004? 19 Q. Didn't do what? 19

A. Yep. And I believe him. I mean, I'm not

going to sit here and say that -- you know, I believe

Q. So you mentioned earlier 2005 was a -- and

what he said. But with that statement, we have no

we're just about to stop here. But you mentioned

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

20

21

22

23

24

25

choice.

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Say one way or another. I didn't make a

Q. But were there times -- you had talked

earlier about Montana complaining to Wyoming that

they wanted to work something out as far as how this

recommendation. That I remember, anyway.

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

compact was managed?

Page 124 Page 122 1 2005 was a pretty good year. 1 for others, including Marty Van Cleave. 2 A. Uh-huh. Well, it was around Billings. I 2 Do you think that's probably a fair 3 was busier than hell up here with flooding. 3 representation of what probably happened that day? 4 Q. And Tongue River Reservoir spilled that A. It sounds reasonable. 5 Q. And who is Marty Van Cleave? 5 year, correct? 6 A. Yeah. 6 A. Marty and I worked together in the Billings 7 7 Q. So are you aware of any kind of a letter or office. He was a water resource specialist. 8 oral call like this May 18th, 2004, letter to Wyoming 8 Q. And what does a water resource specialist 9 from Montana, that year that said shut down the users 9 do? 10 so that we can get enough water? 10 A. He did permitting and changes; we both did. 11 11 A. No. I was the supervisor. He worked with me. 12 MR. MICHAEL: Let's just stop there. And 12 Q. As we go up, it looks -- we see --13 13 there's -- towards the bottom of 13285, there's a we'll get some lunch, and we'll come back. 14 (Whereupon, a break was taken.) 14 message where Jack Stults has sent your original memo 15 BY MR. MICHAEL: 15 to Marty Van Cleave, it appears, at 2:45 on the 17th. 16 Q. Mr. Kerbel, we're back on the record. 16 Does that make sense? 17 You're still under oath. 17 A. Yeah. Yes. 18 I want to give you a couple documents, and 18 O. And Marty e-mailed back two minutes later 19 then we can make sense of these. I am going to give 19 to Jack, we'll see what I can find? A. Correct. 20 you back 12 -- Montana 12988, which is that 20 21 interoffice memorandum we spent time with. 21 Q. And so then apparently Marty would be up 22 22 maybe doing some research to follow up on your A. Right. Q. And then I'm going to give you also another 23 interoffice memo? 23 24 24 document, which is an e-mail string. It's Montana A. Yes. 25 13285. And I want you to look at that really quick. 25 Q. And then we go further up and eventually Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 123 Page 125 1 7 A. Okay. Marty sends the top e-mail back to Jack Stults with a 2 2 subject, "Interstate Water Flows, May 17th." Q. And I'm going to see if I can get that as 3 3 well. And we're still on that same document, 4 4 13285, correct? A. Okay. A. Uh-huh. Yes. O. So I've got both available. I noticed 5 5 6 6 13285, at least the top part, it's a -- the part of Q. And I was interested in that because 7 7 an e-mail string is an e-mail from Marty Van Cleave Marty's e-mail, the first sentence, is Jack, quote, 8 8 to Jack Stults on May 17th, 2004. we have not heard of any junior rights being shut off 9 9 That's what it says, correct? in the Powder/Little Powder/Bighorn or Clark's Fork, 10 10 A. Yes. Q. And it doesn't appear that some of the top 11 And you had testified early that in the 11 12 parts of the string were actually copied to you, but 12 interoffice memo had actually been in personal 13 13 we go back a little further down and we see at the contact by telephone with some of the irrigators out 14 very beginning of the string appears to be an e-mail 14 there on the Powder, correct? A. Uh-huh. 15 from you to Jack Stults, which starts with the same 15 language that was in the interoffice memo? Q. Maybe Mr. Gay was one of them? 16 16 A. This one here? 17 17 A. Uh-huh. O. Yes. 18 Q. And before we go up in the interoffice 18 19 A. Yeah, it probably is. 19 memo, there's different people that you identify in 20 20 Q. So I'm afraid I don't have both pages, so I that memo. 21 A. Uh-huh. This one here? 21 guess can't confirm that. I'm going to ask you to 22 22 operate from the supposition that ultimately we'll be O. Yeah. 23 able to connect this up. And that we started --23 A. Yeah. earlier in the day you had sent the interoffice memo 24 Q. Can you tell me as we sit here today 24 to Jack Stults and he had some follow-up questions 25 whether that was confirmed that day whether any 25 Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 140

ask Jack Stults. But do you know if Montana expected Wyoming to release water that had been stored in priority at Lake DeSmet? Is that what the request was for?

A. There's a difference. And we talked about it earlier this morning.

- Q. Before you go -- I want you to say what you're about to tell me, but I want to make sure you're focused on the question.
- A. I can't speak for Jack. I don't know what he meant here. Because this letter, I -- this is probably all the input I had to this thing.

Q. Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

7

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. And the decision was made to send this in Helena, and I wasn't a party to that decision. I mean, I was at the meetings and stuff, but that decision was made up there.

But the context of the letter, I got a copy and that was it.

- Q. Let me go ahead because I think you and I are on the same page a little. I've applied to my questioning that Montana intrastate would not allow a call for water that was stored in priority because you just told me that in the Tongue River example.
  - A. And Tongue River is a different case than Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

is impacted. As those flows come down, especially past the middle of June, 4th of July, in that area, the water quality on the Powder River is -- because of the water quality, it makes the water unusable.

Most of the time, in most years, normal years, they irrigate, basically, from February, March, April, May. It bounces around dependent upon when water is available. It doesn't happen in February very frequently, but it has happened. I've seen it.

And when I worked down there, they were irrigating in February back in, I think it was, '77 or '78, because we got a spring runoff event. And I think it was around February, March, where water was running everywhere.

So, yeah, I think when they take water on the Powder, it competes when they fill Lake DeSmet. So in my mind, I think we're competing for the same water.

Q. Let me go the next step then and ask you: Let's say there was a year -- and you said there have been years where Montana irrigators are spreading water in February even if it just ices up, the land behind it spider bites, because eventually that water will soak in and add soil moisture.

> Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 139

Page 141

Powder. 2

Q. I want to ask you why it would be a different outcome across state lines involving Lake DeSmet and Powder River, because I think you were trying to get to that. Go ahead.

A. The reason is their period of diversion is different than the Tongue. The period of diversion on the Powder River, basically, like I said before, can start as early as February and it can quit as early as June 30th. And, basically, that -- that's the time period that the folks irrigate on the Powder

Q. In Montana?

A. In Montana. And I don't know about Wyoming, I don't have a clue how they irrigate. I'm thinking -- but anyway, I'm not going to surmise how they irrigate in Wyoming.

But in Montana, the problem is it's not out of priority, in my way of thinking. I can't speak for Jack. In my logic, their period of diversion is completely different than what you are going to have for the Tongue because they're looking for high flows.

And, basically, because if they don't the high flows, their water quality on the Powder River Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

A. Uh-huh.

Q. How would Wyoming know that in that particular year, there was a situation -- if Wyoming is filling DeSmet at that very time, that Wyoming may be filling out of priority based on how the system is working? How would they know that?

Well, maybe let's ask you a better question. How would -- has there been a situation that you know of where Montana officials have notified Wyoming that we have a situation where, if you are filling Lake DeSmet, you're filling it out of priority Wyoming?

A. Well, I know we've had historical conversations from the Wyoming office from our office talking about water shortages in different specific

And the late '80s was one specific instance, an example, where we talked about water shortage situations on both sides of -- both sides of the line. And we basically viewed this. And we're short on water on our side. And I talked to those guys on their side, and they're telling me the same story. They don't have water to give. They says everything over here is -- we're shutting off water to 1890s and before on Tongue River and Goose Creek Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

36 (Pages 138 to 141)

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 144

1 and whatever.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

24

25

Come to find out, they've never shut off water on the Tongue River main stem. I found that out later. But anyway, the bottom line is, is Goose Creek is what they were talking about. I thought they were talking about Tongue. But they do shut water off on Goose Creek, which is a tributary to Tongue. They've never shut water off on main stem Tongue. That's where I was coming from. And -- but they alluded to Goose Creek.

So the bottom line is, is that, yes, we've had conversation historically about shortages that occurred in the late '80s and the early 2000s. And there was a couple years in 1990s, but I don't remember the years, where I've talked to the guys in Wyoming and that's the conversation we had.

And then the frustration, like I said this morning, really develops because when you keep talking to these folks, it's like beating your head against the freaking wall, because the thing I hear over and over again is, on the Tongue, for example, you don't understand how the Bighorns work, Keith. They're not a rock.

And that's all I heard every freaking time.

O. You've told us --

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

1 I'm going to --2

A. Sorry.

Q. I'm trying to stay focused on certain things here in the Powder -- my question was: In a particular time, did Montana, to your knowledge, make a communication with Wyoming?

And we'll get into the details, if you remember one, where the statement was: We have a situation on the Powder where we have people that are irrigating, and I don't care if it's July or February. And you better not be filling Lake DeSmet or you better -- you know, we have a situation where we have certain water rights that aren't being fulfilled, so we need junior water rights in Wyoming to be shut off.

And we have the letter from 2004 and there's one from 2006. But I want to focus on other

MR. WECHSLER: I just want to interject, though. I think that is the question that Mr. Kerbel answered.

22 BY MR. MICHAEL:

O. I just want to be clear.

A. We made a concerted effort, all the while I was hired in my present capacity, to talk to Wyoming. Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 143

Page 145

A. So the frustration, what I'm trying to tell you, Pete, is just -- continues to climb. How many times do I have to ask for water? How many times do I have to go out there and tell them we're short of water?

And then we go talk about the Powder, and they're going -- and Sue, for example, I mean, and Carmine, for example. Well, we're filling Lake DeSmet out of order. I mean, we're filling Lake DeSmet in the spring, basically, and -- so therefore,

we're off the irrigation season. And I says, but you're not off the irrigation season on the Powder

River because the Powder's a different story.

In 2004, I talked to Mike Whitaker. We had a conversation. This is what he told me: He said they finally filled Twin Lakes by Labor Weekend because they were scared to death they weren't going to get it filled because they needed water for the town of Sheridan. And if they didn't get that thing full, which was now one lake because they added on to Twin Lakes and they built Tyack (ph) over there by Buffalo. And I mean, you see what's going on.

And, Pete, the frustration level just continues when you're in my shoes.

Q. In order to move on with the deposition, Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

And I talked to Sue, and I talked to Mike, and I've talked to Carmine. I've talked to all of those folks from different times in different years. I don't have a specific year. But I know those conversations existed in the '80s, a couple years in the '90s and 2000s trying to get water down to our side of the river. I mean, we really tried.

And Mike tried to help me. I mean, he really did. But he didn't have -- he couldn't shut anybody off. I understood that. But just trying to --

- Q. What do you mean "he couldn't shut anybody off"?
- A. Well, that's what he told me. I mean, he didn't have the authority to shut anybody off on a call to Montana.
- O. But the calls -- we have these letters where there's a specific statement: We want you to shut it off so that we get water --
- A. We had conversations. I got on the phone -- what I -- what I'm trying to tell you, Pete, is this -- and I know it's not the answer you want to hear.
  - Q. I don't want the answer; I just want to know the details, if possible. That's what I'm Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 146 Page 148 1 really looking for. 1 example, of what the Powder River was on May 18th, 2 A. I know calls were made. I know I talked to 2 May 17th, 2005. 3 those guys and I know visited with them, talking 3 And I was just curious about the various about water shortages in Montana and talking about 4 4 ways -- you had mentioned that the Powder on May 5 water shortages in Wyoming. 5 17th, in your view, was not -- there was no 6 Q. Did you -- in those calls, did you tell --6 commissioner, so there wasn't really a prior 7 A. We said we were short with water. I don't 7 appropriation scheme of being enforced at that time? 8 8 know what the words were said specifically. I can't A. No. 9 remember. That's a long time ago. But I know we 9 Q. There was not? Okay. 10 discussed the fact that we were out of water on both 10 But there are options that various people 11 the Tongue and the Powder. 11 in Montana have to bring the commissioner in. We Q. And did you say this is what we're cut 12 12 talked about that quite a bit this morning, right? A. Uh-huh. 13 back; so anybody that's junior to that, we'd like you 13 O. And I guess the Powder was adjudicated up 14 to shut them off? 14 15 A. No. We were trying to get -- Pete, we were 15 through a temporary decree as of the early to mid 16 trying to get any water we could. 16 2000s. So the commissioner would have known, on the 17 Q. And you'll agree with me that you weren't 17 Powder, the various water rights, correct? 18 entitled to any water; you were entitled to water --18 A. Uh-huh. Q. You have to say yes. 19 well, I guess that's my --19 2.0 A. We were just hoping to get some water. 2.0 A. Yes. 21 Q. Okay. 21 Q. Let me just look at some documents where 22 A. What I was hoping for was that -- they talk 22 one of yours guys -- I say -- one of Montana's guys, 23 about how stringent they are in shutting people off 23 Marty Van Cleave, apparently had sent some 2.4 and they have a duty of water of 1 to 70. And how 24 information to Jack Stults about various priority 25 they go in there and they have these reports to shut 25 dates. And that's the kind of information that would Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 147 Page 149 1 people off on all these ditches on Goose Creek. And 1 have been available, correct? 2 the frustrating part was, was when I found out that 2 A. Correct. 3 nobody was shut off on main stem Tongue. They don't 3 Q. So I guess I'm trying to work my way 4 have measuring devices on main stem Tongue. 4 through -- if we look at -- I want to use this to 5 And I'm going, okay. The bottom line is, 5 help us maybe as an outline a little bit about 6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

24

25

6 is that when -- and my calls to Mike were: Is there 7 any way that you could go out there to make sure that 8 these guys are using their rightful share. So if 9 there's anything that's leftover, it comes across the 10 state line. How do you know that they're using what they're supposed to be using? 11 12 Because I'm at Dayton and hay's this high, 13 like I said earlier today, and on other side of the line, it's not. So you understand? 14 Q. Oh, I understand seeing green hay. But 15 16 that's true in any appropriation system, correct? A. True. I agree. 17 Q. The prior appropriator may have great hay 18 19 and the junior may have nothing. It's designed to 20 work that way, correct? 21 A. Yeah. 22 Q. I want to show you -- this is a document 23 from Montana's DNRC website. And what I want to just follow up on a little bit is -- because we've looked 24

at some documents here involving what the status, for

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

25

A. Correct.
Q. So I guess I'm trying to work my way through -- if we look at -- I want to use this to help us maybe as an outline a little bit about different ways that a stream could be regulated in Montana depending on various circumstances.

We just talked about the Powder, which had a preliminary decree. So it was in a position to be regulated by commissioner, right?

A. Uh-huh. Yes.
Q. But what about the Tongue River? And, you know, there's a hierarchy in this document that explains -- the State of Montana explains the various ways how this works. But Item No. 3, would you look at Item No. 3 on this document.

A. Yes.

MR. WECHSLER: Excuse me. Are you going to

ys how this works. But Item No. 3, would you look Item No. 3 on this document.

A. Yes.

MR. WECHSLER: Excuse me. Are you going to make this a -
MR. MICHAEL: I think we should. It's a rule, but we had talked about -
MR. WECHSLER: That's true.

MR. MICHAEL: For clarity, the court reporter mark -- let's stop now and have the court reporter mark it.

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 260

1 point out, falls in line with what I told you about a 2 little bit earlier today.

Q. Tell me if you have independent recollection of this, but I look at these documents from 2005 and I see a lot of worry going into the water year as the agenda -- or the meeting we discussed in April. But then Mother Nature bailed folks out with a very good April and May.

A. Yeah. If I remember right, '05 wasn't the greatest snowpack. It started off pretty bad in the fall. But Mother Nature redeemed us and helped us out later in the spring, if I remember right. Because we met late in April that year, and it might be raining in '05 when we met, and we were praying, like, keep it going. We really were.

Because I think the weather really turned on us from the -- January, February, March scared the living bejesus out of us, if I remember right.

Q. I'm going to turn the page on 2005 and see if I have any questions about '06. I don't think I have many, if any.

22 A. You mean in this?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

2.0

21

23

2.4

25

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

17

18

19

20

24

25

Q. Yeah. We'll take that away.

I'm going to give you back the Moy declaration. In fact, let me turn to a page so it Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

1 Tongue?

> A. Correct. And if I remember right, it was broken out into post- and pre-'50 water.

Q. At the bottom of that page we're looking at, the second page letter, final paragraph. Mr. Stults says although this letter is not required by the compact, as compact commissioner for Montana and as directed by Governor Schweitzer, this letter constitutes Montana's call and demand under the terms of the compact for water to satisfy our valid and protected pre-1950 water rights on Tongue and Powder Rivers.

That's what it says, correct?

A. That's correct.

Q. And my question to you is: Earlier today we had looked at some work that you had done along with another fellow whose name escapes me.

A. Van Cleave.

Q. Van Cleave, to get some research together prior to the May 18th, 2004, call letter that we talked about.

Were you involved in getting data together in 2006 to go into this letter that we just -- July 28th of 2006?

A. Well, I would assume that I did because I Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 259

Page 261

makes it easier for both of us that I want to talk to 2 vou about.

A. That would be great.

Q. That's a letter dated -- I'm looking at page -- there's several page markings on it. Let me turn to my copy and then you can keep that one; that would be better.

A. Okay. That'd be great.

Q. This is Exhibit B to the declaration of Richard Moy, you will see, correct?

A. It looks like it, yes.

Q. And it's a letter dated July 28, 2006, to

13 Patrick Tyrrell?

A. Yes.

Q. From Jack Stults?

16 A. Yes.

> Q. If you look on the second page of that letter, the second paragraph down, at the end of that paragraph, says -- Stults says, if so, this should be made available immediately to our users.

21 Speaking of release of storage water for

22 Tongue River users? 23

A. Yeah, I remember this, I think I remember -- Mike gave us that chart, actually.

Q. A chart of storage in Wyoming on the Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

was in pretty much -- I was in communication with the water users on both Powder and Tongue. There was a group of people on the Powder River that I communicated with pretty much during dry years. And I would imagine I probably spent weekends and evenings trying to catch up with those guys to find out how the drainage was and how things were going and how much they irrigated and where they were with their water use for the year.

So I would imagine I -- not knowing full well that I did. But based on my history and what I did in my job, I would think that -- and I'll volunteer the fact that I probably -- and I'm pretty sure that I did, even though I can't directly remember. But I was in pretty good communication with the water users on the Powder River and the board members, like Roger Muggli and Art Hayes on the Tongue.

So I would imagine I was -- if Jack called me and asked me, I'm pretty sure I gave him a pretty good update on where everybody was on the river that year. But God, to tell me what it was, I can't remember what I might have said.

Q. Not what you said so much, but what did you know as of July 28th, 2006, the status to be? Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

Page 266 Page 268 permits in the Tongue or Powder? 1 1 So the first area that I have questions 2 A. No. Because I don't think they have 2 about has to do with this question of what 3 groundwater applications in the Tongue or Powder. If notification Montana gave to the State of Wyoming 4 we did, I don't remember them. 4 about needing water. And earlier you testified in 5 Q. I'm going to whiz through my notes and see 5 questions from Mr. Michael that -- well, Mr. Michael if there's anything burning, and then we'll call it a 6 6 was asking you had there been any specific calls 7 7 asking for either written or otherwise saying you day. 8 Of course, Jeff may have a questions. 8 need to curtail X, Y, and Z water right. 9 9 MR. WECHSLER: Just a few, yeah. Do you remember that testimony? 10 THE WITNESS: And then you're going to have 10 A. Yes. 11 11 Q. And I believe you indicated that you had 12 12 BY MR. MICHAEL: had several discussions at annual meetings about the 13 Q. That is when the fun begins. This is the 13 need that Montana had for water to satisfy early 14 2:30 in the morning stuff. 14 priority water rights; is that correct? 15 A. Correct. 15 A. I thought I was just joking. Obviously, 16 16 Q. And at those annual meetings -- well, Mr. 17 (Whereupon, an off-the-record discussion 17 Michael asked you about the minutes of those annual was had, and a break was taken.) 18 18 meetings. What I'm wondering is: Did all the 19 BY MR. MICHAEL: 19 discussion that occurred at those commission meetings 20 Q. In answer to a prior question, in terms of 20 end up in the minutes? 21 groundwater, you basically said that you didn't --21 A. Of course not. 22 weren't aware of groundwater applications for permits 22 Q. And why was that? in the Tongue and Powder River Basins? 23 A. A lot of the discussions were sidebar. 23 24 A. I don't remember any. 24 They happened during breaks. A lot of them 25 Q. But when you say that, are you referring to 25 happened -- even conversation across the table. And Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 267 Page 269 1 irrigation or -- I mean, it seems to me that -- were 1 a lot of times -- I mean, whether it was at the there applications for domestic or stock or -commission meeting or whether it was at our meeting 2 2 3 A. Yes. You're absolutely right. And I was 3 that we had in the spring, technical team meeting, a 4 4 referring to larger well permits. See, the lot of that stuff just didn't get typed into the 5 connotation, basically, is that if they're a small 5 minutes. 6 groundwater well that's less than 35 gallons a minute 6 I mean, they weren't comprehensive, was 7 7 and 10 acre-feet, that's a domestic stock well, in my what I was trying to say. I mean, they hit the high 8 mind, and that's not a permitted well. 8 spots, like I said earlier. 9 A permitted well, in my definition, 9 Q. You remember during some of those annual 10 10 basically, is anything that exceeds those two commission meetings that you discussed with officials 11 parameters. So that would constitute a permit. 11 from Wyoming, Montana's need for water rights to 12 MR. MICHAEL: Well, I think I'll go ahead 12 satisfy early priority water --13 13 A. Oh, yeah. On water-short years, yeah, and pass the witness. And Jeff may have some 14 14 questions for you. Thank you. that's all we talked about. THE WITNESS: You bet. 15 15 Q. In your position with the DNRC, did you 16 16 have the opportunity to communicate with Montana 17 17 **EXAMINATION** irrigators? 18 18 A. Oh, yes. I mean, that was part of my job. 19 BY MR. WECHSLER: 19 I mean, they communicated with me as much as I 20 Q. So, Mr. Kerbel, as you know, my name is 20 communicated with them. So I got phone calls during

dry years wanting to know -- what questions I would

get is: What priority date does their neighbor have?

And a lot of questions on enforcement and that type

of stuff, but sometimes it didn't go that way.

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

And if they're using water and how things were going.

21

22

23

24

25

21

22

23

24

25

record.

Jeff Wechsler, and I represent Montana. And I have

just a couple of questions, and they are in four

Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

areas. The purpose, really, is to just clarify some

of your earlier testimony so there's no fusion on the

Page 272

I mean, there were tons and tons of questions, especially during drought years, about the process and what they needed to do and everything else. And it's typical when you get into a western state like we are here in Montana and they are in Wyoming and what have you, that by the time you get into a situation in the summer and you're water short and you're fighting with your neighbor and you're throwing things at each other, a lot times you'll go hire an attorney and file a lawsuit.

2.3

And by the time winter comes along, you get three feet of snow on the ground or you get a bunch of rain or whatever, and they're going do I want to spend 40, 50 thousand dollars or not? So a lot of those cases, the person finally goes, well, maybe things are looking better this winter; we'll forego it. So a lot of times -- sometimes they don't make it to court.

I know when we had the meetings with Wyoming, both in the fall and the spring, we were always discussing water availability, how to get water across the state line, what avenues do we need to do in order to accomplish that. And the bottom line is, is there a willingness in order to Wyoming to participate in this -- or develop a management Graf Court Reporting

rights, per se. We talked about getting the dam full
and getting releases so they had water during course
of the summer in order to get some crops, because
that's their livelihood.

Q. You mentioned some years earlier, and I think you were talking about water-short years; is that correct?

A. Yes.

2.4

Q. And as you recall, I heard your testimony earlier, you were talking about the period from 1987 to 1989, a couple years in the 1990s and the 2000s.

Did I miss any years?

A. '83 and '85 were not good, but I don't think I went to too many meetings back then. But I know '85 was a dry year, '86 was a wet year. The fall of '87, things really went downhill from then on. And then kind of climbed back out in the early '90s, 1990s. '89 was a better year, but '88 was the worst year.

I know I talked to the Sheridan boys, the
Wyoming constituency, my counterparts in Wyoming
about what we could do together to work out a
scenario where we could get more water across the
state line. And if they were using water -- if there
was any wasting of water, different scenarios we
Graf Court Reporting

Page 271

Page 273

plan to get more water across the state when we get into short years.

(406) 254-2576

And that was the purpose for these meetings ever since I started attending them in the '80s and '90s and even through my history in my career, was to try to -- and then open lines of communication, was a lot of it, just what was going on in each state. But the reason we were there at every damn meeting was to try to -- at least my purpose was, was to try to influence Wyoming to work with us, to try to get water in Montana.

Did I think that would happen? Probably not, but it was worth a try. At least I could go back and tell the water users in Montana that we gave it a valiant effort.

Q. We were talking about those water users in Montana. And just to be clear, those were irrigators that you were communicating with on the Tongue and Powder River in Montana?

A. Correct.

Q. Did those irrigators on the Tongue and Powder River in Montana communicate that they needed water to satisfy early priority water rights?

A. They just wanted water, Jeff. I mean, to be honest with you, Jeff, we didn't talk about water Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

discussed showing our frustration. And they, basically, came back and they had the same frustration I did too.

(406) 254-2576

So I knew for a fact when we were talking about trying to get water and making call and all this stuff, per se, it was going to be a frustrating discussion because we were all in the same boat. But, yeah, it was a water-short year. And we talked back and forth quite a bit those summers.

Q. In your position with the DNRC, one of your responsibilities or one of your job duties was to be in contact with the Wyoming state engineer personnel?

A. With the compact program, yeah, that was part of my job.

Q. Do you remember which individuals you would have been in contact with?

A. Historically, Carmine LoGuidice, and Mike Whitaker, and Bill Knapp.

Q. During those -- did you communicate to those Wyoming individuals that Montana was needing water during those water-short years?

A. Of course.

Q. And those are those same water-short years that we talked about earlier?

A. Yes.

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 274 Page 276 1 Q. And were those communications, say, 1 showed by Mr. Michael a document that was, I believe, 2 separate from the annual commission meetings? 2 Montana 12988, and that was a memorandum from you to 3 A. Yeah. They were mostly phone calls. And 3 Jack Stults. 4 they occurred in, probably, August when we were all Do you recall that document? 5 frustrated as hell. 5 A. Yeah. That was in 2004? Q. You don't have that before you, but do you 6 Q. Some of those occurred during the 6 7 irrigation season? 7 generally recall that document? 8 A. Oh, of course, they did. 8 A. Yes. 9 Q. And by making those communications to the 9 Q. Do you remember when you were asked to talk 10 State of Wyoming, was it your intent to get Wyoming 10 to the irrigators in order to produce that 11 to do something to get water to Montana? 11 memorandum? 12 A. Well, I probably knew the answer before I 12 A. Yeah. Just, I think, a day or two before. 13 called, but at least it was worth a try. 13 Q. Were you able to talk to all of the 14 Q. Was that your intent? 14 irrigators? 15 A. Yes. 15 A. No. No. We only did a sampling. 16 Q. Well, you mentioned you got frustrated. 16 Q. So that doesn't reflect a complete 17 And I think at one point you said that it felt like 17 discussion with all of the irrigators? 18 banging your head against the wall. 18 A. Of course not. 19 Q. Third topic. During that same discussion 19 What do you mean by that? 20 A. Well, basically when I called Wyoming 20 with Mr. Michael, you were shown a document that, I 21 several times, I was told -- well, I said it earlier 21 believe, was labeled Montana 13285, which was an 22 e-mail from a Marty? 22 today, that, basically, Keith, you think the Bighorn 2.3 23 mountain is a rock. And I've said this before and A. Van Cleave. 24 Q. Thank you. And that wasn't written by you; 24 I'll say it again -- and, basically, I was told it's 25 a sponge; not all the water runs off. So therefore, 25 is that correct? Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 275 Page 277 you're not going to get anything, because it's a 1 1 A. No, it was not. 2 sponge, and, basically, there isn't any water 2 Q. And you didn't have any input into that 3 3 available. e-mail? 4 And I got the impression, from talking to 4 A. No, I didn't. 5 5 the boys in Wyoming, that they couldn't do anything Q. And did you agree with all of the information that was in that e-mail? 6 and they weren't going to do anything. 6 7 7 Q. During any of those years you mentioned, in A. No. I was kind of taken aback on Elgin's 8 8 the mid '80s, in the '90s, and the 2000s, when you water rights being so junior. I didn't think their water rights were that junior. had these discussions with people from Wyoming, did 9 9 10 10 that result in any additional water crossing the Q. Fourth and final topic. You were shown a state line into Montana? 11 couple of oversized maps by Mr. Michael, that I 11 12 A. Not that I saw. But I will say one thing, 12 believe you testified -- or there was discussion and I said it earlier, I did appreciate the fact that 13 13 about it being a 2009 map. Pat Tyrrell asked Mike Whitaker to get some measuring 14 Did you have any involvement in producing 14 device installed on the diversions on main stem, 15 15 that map? because I was told and I was informed that there's 16 A. No. That was done by Helena. 16 never been a commissioner on main stem Tongue. Water 17 Q. Would you consider that map to be the 17 has never been shut off on main stem Tongue. 18 authoritative, most accurate source of information 18 19 about Montana water rights? 19 Q. Fair enough. 20 A. And I think there's an expansion of water 20 A. No, I don't think so. 21 that's a post-'50 on the main stem and tributaries. 21 MR. WECHSLER: That's all questions I have. 22 O. I promised you I would asked about four 22 23 topics, that was the first. And so I want to make 23 **EXAMINATION** this promise: The other three are much shorter. 24 24 So my first question had to do -- you were 25 25 BY MR. MICHAEL: Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

Page 280 Page 278 1 Q. I have a few. 1 to -- he liked to take control of things and do 2 A. I figured. 2 things on his own. 3 O. You discussed with Mr. Wechsler 1988, but 3 O. Do you believe that you had authority on you said -- you talked that year, but then you said 4 behalf of the State of Montana to write such a letter 4 "those summers." And I'm just trying to get a handle 5 as that May 18th, 2004, letter to Pat Tyrrell? 5 6 A. I would have felt uncomfortable doing it, 6 on dates here. 7 7 When did you talk to Mike Whitaker about but, yes, I would have. 8 your frustration? Do you have a date? 8 Q. Based on what? 9 A. No, I don't. 9 A. Pardon me? Q. What was the basis --10 Q. When we talked earlier today in your direct 10 11 11 examination, you talked about meeting with him at On my position. 12 12 Q. In the 1980s, how did you keep phone annual meetings? 13 13 A. Yes. records? Q. And --14 14 A. I didn't. 15 A. We had conversations during the course of 15 O. What if somebody called in and -- was there 16 the summer on the phone. 16 somebody to answer the phone here other than you in 17 Q. And this was in what time frames? '80s? 17 the '80s? 18 '90s? 2000s? When --18 A. Uh-huh. A. All the way. 19 19 O. And it was a man or a woman? Q. From when to when? 20 20 A. It was a woman. 21 A. Oh, God. I'm trying to remember when. 21 Q. What was her name? Or if there were more 22 We had conversation in the '80s. We had 22 than one --23 23 less in the '90s because we had better water years in A. Carla Bornhoft. the '90s. And then we had several discussions in the 24 Q. So if calls came in to her -- so let's say 24 25 drought years of the 2000s. 25 Mike Whitaker tried to called you and a call came in Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 279 Page 281 to her and you weren't here. Would she make a note? 1 Q. So you had phone calls with Mike Whitaker 1 during some of those summers? 2 2 A. Yes. 3 A. Uh-huh. 3 Q. And leave it for you? 4 Q. Mostly '80s and 2000s? 4 A. Yes. 5 A. Late '80s. 5 Q. And were those kept? 6 Q. And what about '83, '85? You mentioned 6 7 7 When were they tossed away? those and then you seem to be unsure of yourself? 8 8 A. Oh, I just was saying those were dry years, A. When I got ahold of Mike. 9 too, but I never contacted Wyoming in those years. 9 Q. So you didn't have a practice of 10 10 maintaining those records of missed calls, correct? Q. Okay. 11 A. I know that for a fact. But we did talk in 11 A. Correct. 12 '87, '88, and '89. 12 Q. And then if he would call you on an issue, would you take notes? 13 Q. Now, in 2004, why was it that Jack Stults 13 A. Sometimes. 14 wrote that May 18th of 2004 letter to Pat Tyrrell and 14 15 15 Q. Did Mike Whitaker ever initiate a phone you didn't? 16 call to you in the 1980s? 16 A. And I didn't? 17 Q. Yeah. Why didn't you write that letter? A. Oh, God. You want me to remember that? I 17 A. He was the commissioner on the compact. 18 don't remember. I know I initiated calls to him. 18 19 O. And what difference does that make? 19 Q. How about in the 1990s? Did he ever 20 A. Well, I don't know. But he felt it 20 initiate a call to you in the '90s? 21 appropriate to come from him, I guess. He felt it 21 A. Yeah, we did. 22 was more appropriate to come from him than me or he 22 O. He --23 would have asked me to write it. He was the division 23 A. I think we did in the '90s because we got 24 to know each other better as time went on. 24 administrator, I assume. And Jack was an individual that he liked O. But you think he initiated at least one 25 25 Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 284

1 call to you in the 1990s?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

15

16

19

A. I would think he would have, yes. I mean, Mike called me up on good years. We had a pretty decent -- I thought Mike and I had a pretty good relationship. I mean, when we got good years, I'd get a phone call from Carmine, I'd get a phone call from Mike, and they would let me know, Keith, I've got a feeling we're going to smile at the end of the summer. You know what I mean?

We'd get those kind of calls. I mean, and that's not a direct quote. But, basically, it was that kind of conversation. And we communicated more during -- I will say we communicated more during better years. And we stayed in pretty good contact. Mike and I still e-mail each other today. But the bottom line is, is that we don't talk about work.

Q. Why should he; he's retired?

A. That's right.

So the bottom line is, is that, yeah, I mean, in the '90s and 2000s, we got along pretty well. We -- at the meetings and stuff -- like we had a meeting down in Buffalo, and we all went golfing together.

I mean, Jeff went with us, and Mike went with us and a bunch of us from Sheridan, we all Graf Court Reporting

(406) 254-2576

1 A. Yeah. To get more water. If we ran into a 2 water-short year and the snowpack was looking pretty 3 bleak, next spring is to work out a management plan 4 where we could work together and share the shortage, 5 that was our goal; that was the reason I felt that we 6 had those annual meetings and the technical team 7 meetings, was to try to develop a management plan so 8 we could work together, two states, and didn't have 9 to sue each other. That was my purpose for being 10 there

> And that's what we discussed. We tried to discuss -- I mean, Susan -- I mean, Sue -- I mean, she was the interstate coordinator. I mean, that was her job. I talked to Sue too. I'd call Sue up and visit with her on occasion to visit about water shortages on Tongue, water shortages on Powder, maybe even the Clark's Fork at times, to see what can be done. And I visited with Sue, basically. She talked about Bear. I don't know where Bear is, but she talked about they had a water management on Bear. And she said it seemed to work with the different states

I felt maybe that could be a -- Jack and I talked about this. And we asked questions about something to that effect at one of the -- I think it Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 283

Page 285

```
golfed the Buffalo course. It was a great course.
2
     So, yeah, we had conversations, good times and bad.
3
```

- Q. Of any of those calls, do we have any notes, any documentation of calls between you and Whitaker?
  - A. Not on my behalf.
  - Q. You don't have any?
  - A. No. I didn't keep a call log.
- Q. You said that in your cross-examination, Mr. Wechsler's questions, every meeting you would try
- 10 11 to influence Wyoming to work with us and give it a 12 try?
- 13 A. That's what I thought the meetings were 14 about.
  - Q. Okay.
  - A. Those were the kind of meetings, I thought.
- 17 Q. And are we talking the annual meetings at 18 that point?
  - A. No.
- 20 Q. It would be some other meeting besides an 21 annual meeting?
- A. No. It would be mostly the annual meeting 22 23 or the technical team meeting.
- 24 Q. And work with us to plan, what -- this is 25 in December, November?

Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

was one of the -- I don't know if it was a telephone conversation or if it was at one of the commissioner meetings, annual meetings, about -- she came in and talked about how the Bear project works, and we were wondering if that would work for Tongue River.

But it didn't go anywhere. It never got off the ground.

- Q. So the idea in those cases, with the annual meetings in November, December, would be to work over the winter to come up with something -- some way to administer water between the two states?
  - A. That was my goal.
- Q. And when I say "administer water," I mean as a practical matter, X head gate gets shut off at X date type thing?

A. Yeah. And Sue was always busy. I mean, she went to more meeting -- I mean, I tried I don't know how many times to set up a meeting to meet Sue in Sheridan or Buffalo or Casper so we could work on this thing with Mike, her, and myself, and Carmine and bring our hydrologist down. And every time we tried to set up a date, it got postponed or something happened or whatever. But she's Miss Meeting Attender. She's got meetings all over the United

States. Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576

Page 286 Page 288 1 So, you know, it got frustrating in a 7 figure out if there's a way to get it done. And 2 sense, and it all went by the wayside, I'm sorry to 2 I think we both ended up with a frustrating 3 3 conversation by the time we both hung up. 4 Q. So do you remember a conversation that you 4 BY MR. MICHAEL: 5 had with Mike Whitaker where the gist of what you 5 Q. So after you made that statement to Mike said to him was Montana demands that Wyoming . . . 6 Whitaker in one of those years and then immediately 6 7 call up Jack Stults or Gary Fritz and say, hey, I 7 A. No, it wasn't worded that way. 8 Q. Or that Montana would like, pretty 8 told Wyoming I want them to deliver water, curtail 9 please -- okay? And this is in an irrigation season. 9 water users to satisfy water use on the Tongue and 10 A. Uh-huh. 10 Powder; I want you to know this, that I've done this? 11 11 A. No, I did not. Q. -- Wyoming to regulate one or more water 12 12 users in Wyoming so that more water shows up at the Q. And why didn't you do that? A. This was a conversation between Mike and I 13 state line this year sometime in the near future? 13 14 to try to solve a problem. 14 A. Correct. Q. You said that to him? A. Yes. 15 15 Q. But did you expect Mike Whitaker to report 16 16 that to Wyoming authorities and take action --Q. And what year was that? 17 17 A. I can always hope. 18 A. I'm sure it was '88. I'm thinking it was 18 O. -- in the near future? '88. I know we talked about it in 2000 because 2000, 19 You expected that? 19 20 A. No. To answer your question, no. But I 20 2001 were tough years as well, that whole period in 21 21 thought it was worth a try. My expectations were there. 22 Q. In '88, what time of year was that when 22 really low, and they were met. 2.3 23 Q. In 2004, May 17th of 2004, we looked at you --24 A. I was thinking it was probably late summer. 2.4 your interoffice memorandum of that date. 25 25 July, August would be my recollection. A. Yes. Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576 Page 287 Page 289 Q. And your recollection would be just you and 1 1 Q. Do you recall that? Mike Whitaker? 2 2 And you just testified a minute ago that at 3 A. Yes. 3 that time you did not make an effort to cover all the Q. No witnesses? 4 4 irrigators in the Powder River and see what their 5 5 A. No. It would just be Mike and I. situation was; is that correct? A. That is correct. I just took a sampling. 6 6 Q. And you don't have any records of that --7 7 any written records of that yourself? I tried to pick out the larger water users that I 8 A. No, I don't. 8 knew and that I had a communication with. And then I O. So the only possibility for written record 9 9 went through and checked out some of the other guys 10 10 would be Mike Whitaker would have something in downstream. So I tried to get a sampling from top to 11 11 bottom. writing? 12 A. (Indicating.) 12 Q. So as of the next day, May 18th, 2004, did 13 you have enough information to be able to say that 13 O. Is that correct? A. That is correct. 14 14 there are no -- which water right users were diverting and which ones weren't? 15 Q. Any other years than the two you just said? 15 16 You said 1988 and 2000 that occurred. 16 A. No. I didn't know if all of them were or MR. WECHSLER: I think he's answered that 17 if -- I just knew the people that I talked to. They 17 18 18 mentioned other water users in the drainage had as well. 19 19 THE WITNESS: Yeah. I mean, we talked similar situations as they did, and that's as far as 20 20 other years too. But I mean, those were the few it went. They pretty much ran out of water by the 21 worst years: 2004, 2002, 2006. I know we had 4th of July. 21 22 MR. MICHAEL: I don't have any further 22 those conversation in those years, by my 23 23 recollection. And a lot of it was frustration questions. You're done. 24 on both our parts. 24 (Whereupon, the deposition concluded at 25 We ended up talking to each other, trying 25 5:23 p.m.) Graf Court Reporting Graf Court Reporting (406) 254-2576 (406) 254-2576

```
Page 290
                CERTIFICATE OF DEPONENT
1
 2
 3
      PAGE: LINE: CORRECTION:
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
            I have read the foregoing transcript of my
      testimony and believe the same to be true, except for
13
      the corrections noted above.
14
15
            DATED this
                              day of
16
      2012.
17
18
19
                  KEITH KERBEL, Deponent
20
            SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me this
      day of
                      , 2012.
21
22
23
24
            Notary Public for the State of Montana
             Residing at
                                 , Montana
25
             My Commission expires:
                 Graf Court Reporting
                   (406) 254-2576
                                                    Page 291
              CERTIFICATE OF COURT REPORTER
 1
 2
      State of Montana
 3
      County of Yellowstone )
  4
         I, John B. Graf, Court Reporter and Notary Public
       in and for the State of Montana, residing in Billings,
  5
       Montana, do hereby certify:
  6
         That I was duly authorized to and did report the
  7
  8
       foregoing deposition after having duly sworn KEITH
  9
       KERBEL to the truth; that the deposition was taken at
10
       the time and place stated on the caption hereto; that
11
       the testimony of the deponent was taken in shorthand
       by me and subsequently reduced to writing under my
12
13
       direction; that the foregoing is a true and correct
       transcript of the testimony given by said deponent.
14
15
          I further certify that I am not counsel, attorney
16
       nor relative or employee of any party, nor otherwise
17
       interested in the event of this action.
          IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto subscribed my
18
19
       name and affixed my notarial seal this 12th day of May
20
       2012.
21
22
23
                  JOHN B. GRAF, Court Reporter and
 24
                  Notary Public, State of Montana
                  Residing in Billings, Montana
 25
                  My Commission Expires 9-11-2012
                  Graf Court Reporting
                   (406) 254-2576
```

	Page 290
1	CERTIFICATE OF DEPONENT
2	PAGE: LINE: CORRECTION: 220 17 exit excess (2x's)
3	PAGE: LINE: CORRECTION: 198 22 contract compact
4	1 16 TARE OUL 232 154/1 Fort Union Fort
5	47 20 USE 235 10 tive 48 11 AS Well. 264 17 ARMOTRES McBirney
6	50 12 tand to line
7	59 3 2,000 200
/	78 3 priver dam
8	83 3 for spraying haying
9	85 99 7 Stayed state
10	103 9 Towder Kroer Jonque River
11	113  9  113  113  11  11  11  11  11  11
12	I have read the foregoing transcript of my
13	testimony and believe the same to be true, except for
14	the corrections noted above.
15	DATED this 30th day of MAY,
16	2012.
17	feet feets
18	
19	KEITH KERBEL, Deponent Keith Kerbel
20	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me this 3044
	day of May , 2012.  MARGARET A VENTLING NOTARY PUBLIC for the
21	SEAL State of Montana  ** Residing at Billings, Montana
22	My Commission Expires February 26, 2016
23	Margaret A. Conting
24	Notary Public for the State of Montana
25	Residing at Billings , Montana
25	My Commission expires: February 26, 2016  Graf Court Reporting
Laboratoria de la constanta de	(406) 254-2576